Can CARE’s Community Score Card improve Community Health Worker performance and accountability?

Thumbiko Msiska, CARE Malawi
PRESENTATION OUTLINE

- CSC Approach
- Evidence: Results and Impact
- Advantages and Challenges
- Sustainability
- Replication and Scale Up
Approach
Approach – CARE’s Community Score Card (CSC)
A social accountability approach that brings together community members, service providers, and local government to
- identify service access, utilization and provision challenges;
- mutually generate solutions;
- and work in partnership to implement and track the effectiveness of those solutions in an ongoing process of improvement.
CSC Theory of Change

Community Score Card

Women & Community Empowered

Negotiated Space Expanded, Inclusive & Effective

Health Workers Empowered

Improved Health Behaviors

Increased Utilization of & Satisfaction With Services

System and Institutional Changes

Increased Coverage, Quality & Equity of Services

Improved Health Worker Effectiveness

Maternal & Neonatal Mortality
PHASE I: PLANNING AND PREPARATION

PHASE II: Conducting the Score Card with the Community

PHASE III: Conducting the Score Card with Service Providers

PHASE IV: Interface Meeting and Action Planning

PHASE V: Action Plan Implementation and M&E

CARE’s Community Score Card Methodology
Evidence
CSC RCT Overview

**Project:** Maternal Health Alliance Project

**Donor:** Sall Family Foundation

**Implementers:** CARE, in partnership with the Government of Malawi

**Dates:** January 2011- December 2015 (evaluation 2012-2014)

**Location:** Ntcheu district, Malawi

**Goal:** to identify, test and share broadly applicable approaches for improving reproductive and maternal health services and outcomes.

### Evaluation Design

- **Cluster-randomized control design**
  - 10 intervention sites
  - 10 control sites
  - Study population = 398,230

- **Health facilities were matched and randomly assigned to either intervention or control**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Women’s Survey</th>
<th>Score Card Indicator Monitoring Data</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cross-sectional, quantitative</td>
<td>Score Card Indicators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Face-to-face survey</td>
<td>• 12 indicators per Score Card</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baseline (2012) sample = 1,301</td>
<td>• 10 intervention sites</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Endline (2015) sample = 1,300</td>
<td>• 3-4 rounds of Score Cards per site</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis</td>
<td>Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difference in Differences Approach</td>
<td>• Scores for each indicator 0-100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instrumental Variable Approach</td>
<td>• Compared first and last score for each indicator</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Analysis:

- Difference in Differences Approach
- Instrumental Variable Approach

Z-test of statistical significance
Score Card Indicator Results

Significant Changes (p≤ 0.05)

- Availability and accessibility of information: First Score 73, Last Score 96
- Level of male involvement: First Score 40, Last Score 74
- Reception of clients at the facility: First Score 47, Last Score 83
- Relationship between health workers and communities: First Score 44, Last Score 80
- Commitment of service providers: First Score 55, Last Score 81
- Level of youth involvement: First Score 37, Last Score 60

First Score: Green, Last Score: Teal
Women’s Survey Results: Headline

- **Increase in Community Health Worker visits:**
  - 20% greater increase in health worker visits for antenatal care in the intervention area
  - 6% greater increase in health worker visits for postnatal care in the intervention area

- **Satisfaction with Services:**
  - Increase in overall satisfaction with health services

- **Modern Family Planning:**
  - 57% increase in use of modern methods of family planning.
Conclusions

- By facilitating the relationship between community members, health service providers, and local government officials, the CSC contributed to important improvements in reproductive health-related outcomes.
- The CSC can be an effective strategy for increasing CHW home visits during both pregnancy and the postnatal period.
- CHW programs are often plagued by insufficient community involvement and weak linkages to the formal health system – the CSC provides a concrete approach to tackling these issues.
- One of the greatest strengths of the CSC is that it helps build a strong, trusting relationship between health workers and community members. This relationship is a critical driver of service utilization and satisfaction.
- The CSC builds mutual accountability, and ensures that solutions to problems are locally relevant, locally supported and feasible to implement.
Advantages and Challenges
Advantages

• **Common understanding** of issues and solutions to problems

• **Community participation, dialogue and improved relationship** with service providers

• **Empowers service users:** community monitoring of services, increased community ownership of services and projects

• **Accountability, transparency, and responsibility** from service providers

• **Clarifies roles and responsibilities of service users** in service delivery

• **Can expose corrupt officials**

• **Tool** for community and service providers to monitor progress and service quality

Challenges

• It requires **time and excellent facilitation skills.**

• It can sometimes lead to **conflict** if not facilitated well.

• **Individuals** can be **targeted** (rather than services and systems).

• It can raise **high expectations,** which are difficult to meet in the short term.

• It requires an **enabling environment** (democracy, decentralized systems, policies on social monitoring, willingness from government representatives, adequate budget allocation, etc.)
Sustainability
Sustainability

1. **Politically smart**: identifying who can help bring about change
2. **Locally led**: Community Score Card structured identification of community priorities
3. **Locally owned**: community members and frontline providers invested governance over local health services
4. **Focused on tangible need** (e.g. better maternity service) rather than general objective (e.g. improved health)
5. **Adaptive to changing context and over long term**
6. **Builds alliances** for learning and support to help bring about change and overcome barriers
7. Adopted by community members like Youth Groups in Ntcheu and District Health Office

Ref: Sue Unsworth “It’s the politics! Can donors rise to the challenge?”
Replication & Scale
Replication & Scale: CARE’s CSC Consulting Group

Training facilitators and trainers

Direct project implementation

Design and advice on adaptation of process to your programme

Follow-up and advocacy review

Thumbiko.msiska@communityscorecardconsultinggroup.com

David.waller@communityscorecardconsultinggroup.com

www.communityscorecardconsultinggroup.org
Community Score Card tools and resources

- **CSC Toolkit**
  http://familyplanning.care2share.wikispaces.net/The+Community+Score+Card

- **Films**
  www.raisingthescore.org

- **Evidence on CSC**


